

**Politics and ethnicity:
A study of the role of state security
interests in the maintenance of
Aboriginal difference in Taiwan**

Martin John Williams

A thesis presented in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of
Doctor of Philosophy in Humanities and Social Sciences

Faculty of Humanities and Social Sciences
University of Technology, Sydney

July 2005

CERTIFICATE OF AUTHORSHIP/ORIGINALITY

I certify that the work in this thesis has neither been previously submitted for a degree, nor submitted as part of requirements for a degree except as fully acknowledged within the text.

I also certify that the thesis was written by me. Any help that I received in my research work and the preparation of the thesis has been acknowledged. In addition, I certify that all sources of information and literature used are indicated in the thesis.

Signature of candidate



Acknowledgements

This research was possible because of the kindness and patience of many people. First and most importantly, I would like to thank my supervisor, Associate Professor Feng Chongyi 馮崇義, whose dedication, trust and unfailing support over a long period of time ensured that this work reached its conclusion. To him I owe a debt to which these words cannot begin to do justice. I also thank Chen Xiuping 陳秀萍, his wife, for her enthusiastic hospitality over the years.

In Australia, I received financial support and generous access to facilities from the Institute for International Studies at the University of Technology, Sydney (UTS). In particular, I thank Milica Gavran for her cheerful assistance with administrative matters. I would also like to thank a former member of staff, Wendy Robjohns, for her help in the first years of my candidature. A current member of staff, Dr. Kate Barclay, was my office mate at the institute and offered years of support and good advice. Elsewhere at UTS, I want to thank Associate Professor Hilary Yerbury for her counsel.

The main source of funds for the first half of this candidature was an Australian Postgraduate Award. I also received significant financial and housing assistance from my mother, Annette Williams; Mrs. Lee Lin Tsui-chin 李林翠琴 in Taipei; and Dremedreman Tuvelcljem (Edem) 湯賢慧, my fiancée, also in Taipei.

During the first two periods of fieldwork in Taiwan, I was honoured to be hosted by the Program for Southeast Asian Area Studies (PROSEA). The program, which under the direction of Prof. Hsin-huang Michael Hsiao 蕭新煌 has been upgraded to the Center for Asia-Pacific Area Studies (CAPAS), allowed me the chance to meet tremendous people and locate important sources of information and advice. Prof. Hsiao was very generous with his time and facilities and I thank him. I also wish to offer thanks to the program's indefatigable office manager and researcher, Ms. Lin Shu-huei 林淑慧, who provided a warm welcome and assistance whenever needed.

While in Taiwan I received invaluable advice from Dr. Fiorella Allio 艾茉莉, whose

acquaintance I cherish and whose passion for her work is an inspiration. In the course of my fieldwork I received selfless assistance from too many people to list here; however, I wish to acknowledge the following people for their generous help as interviewees: the late Mr. Lai Hung-yen 賴紅炎 and his wife Tsai Mei-yu 蔡美玉, the late Mr. Li Lai-wang 李來旺, the late Mr. Lin Pao-teh 林寶德, Mr. and Mrs. Ma Lai-sheng 馬來盛, Mr. and Mrs. Hua Ai 華愛, Mr. Hua A-tsai 華阿財, Mr. Chang Po-lung 章博隆, Mr. Chen Hua-feng 陳華封, Mr. Tien Tzu-hsiung 田子雄 and Mr. Sha Chao-fu 沙朝夫. Certain interviewees and informants cannot be named here but I thank them for their time and energy.

I also received most valuable assistance from Mr. Tang Chiu-ju 湯九如, Tang Hsien-che 湯賢哲 and family, Voyu Yakumangana 楊智偉 and his family, Nagay 林思庭, Prof. Tibusungu e Peongsi 汪明輝, Tsun-i Cheng 鄭純宜, Dr. Li Ming-juinn 李明峻, the Rev. Michael Stainton 史邁克, Prof. Pu Chung-cheng 浦忠成, Darius Edler, Dr. Hong-Zen Wang 王宏仁, Sakuliu Pavavalung 撒古流, Tien Chun-chou 田春綢, Tadao Maruyama 丸山忠夫 (for driving through a typhoon, and everything else), Wang Tien-ming 王田明, Li Shang-tien 李尚典, Kao Ying-chieh 高英傑, Wu Yu-chu 吳玉珠, Saviki 石丸雅邦, the Rev. and Mrs. Bryan Dillon, and especially Chen Su-chen 陳素貞, who granted me significant amounts of her time and allowed me generous access to her personal files.

I lived with the Lee family in my first year in Taiwan – Mrs. Lee, Susan 李淑萍, Wan-ping 李婉萍 and Chung-ping 李忠萍 – whose kindness and civility provided the best possible environment in which to begin this work, and who made many allowances for this interloper.

On a more personal note, I want to thank the following special people who have stuck with me throughout. In Australia: Susanna Davis, Jane Eccleston, Jenny Giotas, Victoria Pomfret, Declan Nolan, Yiyan Wang 王一燕, Matthew Winefield 王默修, Anna Wong 黃小盈, Lee Wong 黃燕莉 and Dennis Ngo; in Taiwan: Laurence Eyton 艾頓; and especially Scott Sosa in the United States.

Edem, my fiancée, and her son, Ta-jen 湯大任, have been steadfast in their support throughout this project and I am indebted for their love and sacrifices – not least

enduring my interminable absences. Edem assisted on countless occasions with my Chinese and was a fellow traveller and interpreter for the Paiwan language during fieldwork. She was also a judicious filter for many of the ideas raised in this thesis.

I would also like to thank the three examiners of this thesis for their detailed responses to the material and for their insights and suggestions in improving the work.

Finally, I would like to make special mention of four people who offered selfless support and important advice at critical times. My mother, who apart from everything else is a tremendous friend and confidante; my father, John D.B. Williams, who was always available to help and whose work and research provided powerful motivation; Mr. John Piechocki, who persevered and got the engine running again; and Dr. Yew-Jin Fang 方友真, whose commitment to her profession and to a friend will not be forgotten.

All of these people contributed to the quality of this work. Any errors or other shortcomings are my own.

Dedicated to:

my mother and my father

the memory of my grandmother, Constance Howland (1919-2003)

and the memory of Lai Hung-yen (1934-2004).

Preface

A few years ago I attended a party thrown by Taiwan's de facto consulate in Sydney at what is now called the Sofitel Wentworth Sydney hotel. It was a celebration of the 10th of October, or "Double Ten," the national day of the Republic of China. It was noisy and well attended – mostly overseas Taiwanese and local businesspeople. Various dignitaries, including the garishly dressed head of the consulate, spoke on stage but no one seemed to listen to them, preferring to talk with their companions rather loudly; the speeches were drowned out despite a microphone being used. Formalities over, two white Australian musicians performed a rendition of *New York, New York*, but the lyrics had been altered throughout: "I wanna be a part of it/Taipei, Taipei" is still lodged in my mind. I turned my attention to a screen on the stage. It was showing images of Taiwan: the geography, people, architecture, schools, food, various cultural goings-on. And as the barely watched slide show progressed, it appeared that fully one quarter to one third of the slides depicted Taiwan's *Aboriginal* people and culture.

It strikes me now that this familiar state appropriation of indigenous culture contains a delicious irony in the case of Taiwan. As with indigenous peoples elsewhere, for hundreds of years Taiwan's Aborigines were subject to profound intervention that killed countless thousands, changed community power configurations and deliberately destroyed "traditional" material and spiritual culture. This process entered what could have been its final phase when the Japanese secured – somewhat precariously – the most remote and best-defended Aboriginal territories on the island in the first decades of the twentieth century. But with the Japanese and the Chinese Nationalists having tried so hard, for various reasons, to assimilate indigenous culture and Aboriginal identity out of existence since that time, here in Sydney were unofficial representatives of Taiwan's government, none of whom was Aboriginal, now employing that same culture to visually define its national identity before international witnesses in a battle against *political assimilation by China*. Taiwan's Aboriginal culture, seemingly so weak in the face of assimilationist policy, had in a sense assimilated the state – and it didn't even have to try. The question that follows is how the presence of an ethnic minority so vulnerable can endure and, after a time, be so powerful.

Contents

Certificate of authorship/originality	<i>ii</i>
Acknowledgements	<i>iii</i>
Preface	<i>vi</i>
Contents	<i>vii</i>
List of illustrations and tables	<i>xi</i>
A note on Romanisation, Chinese characters and abbreviations	<i>xiii</i>
Abstract	<i>xiv</i>

Chapter One **Introduction: Ethnicity, Aboriginality and Taiwan** **1**

Ethnicity	5
The dialectic of ascription	5
Ascription and assimilation	6
‘Cultural stuff’	9
Aboriginality	10
Authenticity and the definition of an Aborigine	11
Taiwan Aboriginal nomenclature and demographics	16
Is Aboriginality a special ethnicity?	25
Racism and assimilation	27
The assimilationist agenda	30
Aboriginality and pan-Aboriginality	36
Pan-Aboriginality is not a nationalism	36
Aberration as fact or ascription	47
Complexity of the dialectic on the ground	49
State power versus strategising Aboriginal individuals	52
Internal colonialism and welfare colonialism	54
Taiwan’s Aborigines and the state	57
Aborigines and the anthropologists	57
State security and assimilation	61
Religion	64
Method	66
The argument	68

Chapter Two **Early history, Japanese rule and the origins of Aboriginality** **71**

Prehistory, European rule, Koxinga and the Qing	71
Transformation in the Japanese era	77
Four phases of administration	77

The Wushe Uprising	78
Foundations of pan-Aboriginal identity	80
Conclusions	82
 Chapter Three Aborigines and the ‘Glorious Recovery’	 84
China’s initial Aboriginal discourse	84
The Taiwan Investigative Committee	87
Later commentary	90
‘Retrocession’	92
Initial meetings with KMT officials	93
The beginning of administrative action	101
Other local contact and relief operations	106
Chen Yi at Sun Moon Lake, Alishan and Mutan	114
Renewal of cultural expression	116
Kao I-sheng and the Tsou in the media	118
Kao I-sheng and the rice dumpling murders	124
The developing assimilationist discourse	130
Provincial and national representation	136
Security and Aborigines	139
The recruitment of Aboriginal police	139
Pre-228 Incident threats to security	140
Conclusions	146
 Chapter Four Patterns of Aboriginal involvement in the 228 Incident	 148
Aboriginal intervention opposing the government	152
Attacks in Taipei by Atayal Aborigines	152
Unrest in Miaoli County	156
Mobilisation and resistance in Taichung City	156
Battle in Nantou: The Aboriginal role in the 27 Unit	162
The 27 Unit and Wushe	166
The retreat to Puli	167
Clashes at Sun Moon Lake	174
The Tsou mobilisation in Chiayi	176
Sanctuary for a mainlander	188
Flamethrowers in Pingtung	189
The death of a schoolteacher and hatred of mainlanders	192
Aboriginal intervention supporting the government	200
Ma Chih-li and the pacification of Taitung	200
Other Bunun involvement	210
Cases of aborted Aboriginal mobilisation	211
Tardy pigs and rumour in Wulai	211
Instability in Ilan	215

Discord and gang rape in Taoyuan	220
Rejection and rewards in Hsinchu	222
Near-mobilisation in Kaohsiung	223
A death in Hengchun and preparations for conflict	226
Truku anger in Hualien	228
Sanctuary among the Amis	234
Praise in a petition	236
Other unrest in Hualien	239
Amis involvement in Taitung	243
Amis and Kavalan actions in Hualien	245
Penghu	247
Cases of Aboriginal non-intervention	248
Aboriginal students in Tainan	248
Yami non-involvement	248
Conclusions	249
 Chapter Five The <i>qingxiang</i> campaign and Aboriginal activism	 252
 The aftermath of the 228 Incident	252
Nan Chih-hsin and the Taipei disposal committee	257
Pai Chung-hsi and the 228 Incident	261
Pai Chung-hsi and the question of minority nationalities	270
Chiang Ching-kuo and 228	276
‘Cleansing the countryside’	278
The Southern Pacification Zone	279
The Eastern Pacification Zone	280
The Central Pacification Zone	283
The Hsinchu Pacification Zone	284
The Keelung Pacification Zone	285
The Taipei Pacification Zone	286
Mountain security and the phantom Japanese army	288
Aboriginal activism in the wake of 228	291
The Alishan security threat	292
The campaign for Aboriginal self-government	294
A semblance of stability	299
Kao I-sheng’s model for autonomous Aboriginal government	303
Conclusions	310
 Chapter Six The White Terror and quarantined Aboriginality	 313
 Hsinmei Farm	 314
Crackdown on an Amis ‘secret organisation’	315
The raid on Leyeh Village	316

Aboriginal dissidence in National Security Bureau files	318
The Mountain Area Work Committee and Alishan	319
The <i>Sedition Case of Kaoshan Bandit agent Tang Shou-jen et al.</i>	327
The ‘Penglai’ sedition case	334
Monitoring of dissidents and families	345
Other National Security Bureau cases	348
Taiwan Garrison Command data	355
Assimilation discourse in <i>Shihchien</i>	360
Conclusions	366
 Chapter Seven Aboriginality and nativisation:	 368
Christ and culture in the subversion	
of assimilation	
 The Presbyterian subversion of assimilation	 372
Mountain area security measures	373
George Vicedom and the paradox of assimilation	377
A spiritual ‘vacuum’?	380
Resisting Chinese society	381
The scene ten years later	388
Official hostility toward missionaries	390
Harassment of Catholics	392
A Catholic lecture at a KMT think tank	394
A cultural form of subversion: the plans of Lai Hung-yen	395
The hopelessness of the campaign	401
The vacuum of the present	402
KMT indecision and permissible Aboriginality	405
Conclusions	407
 Chapter Eight Conclusion	 409
 Appendices	 414
A Ethics consent form for interviewees authorised by the	415
Human Ethics Research Committee of the	
University of Technology, Sydney	
B Statement submitted to the Control Yuan by Lai	416
Hung-yen	
C Glossary of Chinese and Japanese names and expressions	418
 References	 428

List of illustrations and tables

All photographs in this thesis were taken by me. Figure 3.1 was produced with reference to Map King Publishing Co Production Department (ed.)(2003): *Taiwan zou toutou ditu wang*. Taipei: Map King Publishing.

Illustrations	Page
Figure 3.1: Map of Taiwan's cities, counties and Aboriginal townships	94
Figure 3.2: Scan of a story in the November 7, 1946, edition of the <i>Taiwan Hsinshengpao</i> on the rice dumpling murders, including photographs of Rukai Aboriginal suspects	128
Figure 3.3: Mr. Sha Chao-fu at his residence in Pingtung County	128
Figure 3.4: Scan of a story in the November 5, 1946, edition of the <i>Taiwan Hsinshengpao</i> on the Tahsi Village incident	143
Figure 4.1: Images of Kuo Tien-tsai and Lai Wen-tsai	230
Figure 5.1: Commemorative photograph for a meeting of government, military and civilian leaders at the Taipei Guesthouse taken on March 26, 1947	267
Figure 5.2: Image of a memento portrait presented to Ma Chih-li by General Pai Chung-hsi dated March 28, 1947	275
Figure 5.3: Photograph of a meeting of the Taiwan Province Eastern Pacification Zone Command dated April 8, 1947, featuring Ma Chih-li	282
Figure 5.4: Commemorative photograph for a meeting of the Taiwan Province Eastern Pacification Zone Command dated April 8, 1947, featuring Ma Chih-li	282
Figure 5.5: Scan of Kao I-sheng's plan for autonomous Aboriginal government from intelligence document dated March 28, 1947, including markings showing examples of discrepancies with Figure 5.6	308
Figure 5.6: Scan of Kao I-sheng's plan for autonomous Aboriginal government from intelligence document dated April 2, 1947, including markings showing examples of discrepancies with Figure 5.5	308
Figure 6.1: Scan of story in the March 14, 1951, edition of the <i>Central Daily News</i> on meetings between Aboriginal delegates from Hualien County and Wufeng Township and Chiang Kai-shek, Chen Cheng and other senior officials, including photograph of Kao I-sheng and Kao Chu-hua meeting Chen Cheng	317

Figure 6.2: Ex-political prisoner Wu I-te in Tapang Village during its biannual <i>mayasvi</i> (Tsou war ceremony) in February 2000	328
Figure 6.3: Kao Ying-chieh in Tapang Village during its biannual <i>mayasvi</i> (Tsou war ceremony) in February 2000	346
Figure 6.4: The Tapang Village memorial for the 228 Incident	349
Figure 6.5: Far view of Kao I-sheng's grave in Tapang Village, Alishan Township, Chiayi County	350
Figure 6.6: Near view of Kao I-sheng's grave in Tapang Village, Alishan Township, Chiayi County	350
Figure 7.1: Presbyterian clergy and guests pray during an activity for women church members at the Nei-Pu Senior Agricultural-Industrial Vocational High School in Shuimen, Neipu Township, Pingtung County, in August 1999	387
Figure 7.2: Paiwan women pray during a Presbyterian cultural activity at the Nei-Pu Senior Agricultural-Industrial Vocational High School in Shuimen, Neipu Township, Pingtung County, in August 1999	387
Figure 7.3: Lai Hung-yen, his wife Tsai Mei-yu and their grandchildren at the Lai residence in Tajen Township, Taitung County in October, 1999	397
Figure 7.4: An impression of Lai Hung-yen's Aboriginal national flag	397
Figure 7.5: Mourners place Lai Hung-yen's coffin in a hearse to be taken to burial after his funeral service in Taipan Village, Tajen Township, Taitung County, on April 11, 2004	404
Figure 7.6: Mourners wait for Lai Hung-yen's hearse to depart his funeral service in Taipan Village, Tajen Township, Taitung County, on April 11, 2004	404

Tables	Page
Table 1.1: Aboriginal population of Taiwan in absolute numbers and as a percentage of the total population for selected years	23
Table 1.2: Present-day population of official Taiwan Aboriginal ethnic groups	24

A note on Romanisation, Chinese characters and abbreviations

Place names and the names of authors of Chinese-language works whose English names are not available are written using the bastardised Wade-Giles system of Romanisation peculiar to Taiwan. Terms and expressions are written in italics in Hanyu Pinyin. To compensate for this clash of Romanisation systems, Chinese-language references are accompanied by a corresponding English title or translation, together with the title in Hanyu Pinyin and the title and the name of the author(s) in Chinese characters.

The characters for all Chinese- and Japanese-language names, places, terms and organisations are listed in Appendix C.

Some of the more frequently used sources are abbreviated in the footnotes after the first reference. For convenience, a list of these precedes the references at the back of the thesis.

Abstract

This thesis analyses the conflicting relationship between Kuomintang (KMT) security measures and assimilation policies in relation to Taiwan's Aboriginal population from 1945 to the beginning of the modern Aboriginal movement. I refer to the social anthropological model of ethnicity in examining the impact of these policies on Aboriginal leaders and expressions of Aboriginality. New evidence is presented showing that expressions of pan-Aboriginality prior to the 228 Incident existed, but that in the main, Aboriginal involvement in the 228 Incident reflected a growing identification with Han Taiwanese in the face of an unpopular administration. I provide the first comprehensive analysis of this involvement, together with the impact of the security census that followed it, which involved replacing the emerging dialectic of ascription between Han Taiwanese and Aborigines with a remote form of assimilationist control.

Primary sources of data included newspapers on microfiche between 1945 and 1952, which produced more than one thousand items relating to Aboriginal affairs, and which filled a sizable gap in research on this period. Extensive use was also made of archived material on the 228 Incident and the White Terror, while fieldwork and interviews were conducted in the Aboriginal townships of eight counties.

I conclude that Aboriginality was sustained and shaped by the incompatible policy requirements of a martial-law era administration. Factors causing the failure of assimilationist policies include the presence of Christian denominations in Aboriginal communities – which nourished Aboriginality so that they could survive – and the KMT's own appropriation of Aboriginality. From this I conclude that sustained and forcible uses of categorisation in the context of an Aboriginal population are more capable of reinforcing and creating ethnic boundaries than destroying them.